

ASO AC Teleconference
Wednesday, 02 November 2022
12:00 PM UTC
Minutes

Attendees	Observers	Apologies
AFRINIC Mike Silber (Mike S.) – Vice Chair APNIC Nicole Chan (Nicole C.) Shubham Saran (Shubham S.) ARIN Kevin Blumberg (Kevin B.) – Chair Chris Quesada (Chris Q.) Martin Hannigan (Martin H.) LACNIC Esteban Lescano (Esteban L.) Jorge Villa (Jorge V.) Ricardo Patara (Ricardo P.) RIPE NCC Hervé Clément (Hervé C.) – Vice Chair James Kennedy (James K.) Secretariat Germán Valdez (Germán V.) Laureana Pavón (Laureana P.) – Minutes	ARIN Sean Hopkins (Sean H.) AFRINIC Madhvi Gokool (Madhvi G.) ICANN Staff Ozan Sahin (Ozan S.)	AFRINIC Saul Stein (Saul S.) APNIC Di Ma (Di M.) RIPE NCC Sander Steffan (Sander S.)

New action items from this meeting:

New Action Item 221102-1: Each subgroup of the Procedures Review Team to meet before late November/early December to consolidate all the suggestions and discussions that took place in Belgrade and start working on a concrete proposal for each of the sections of the procedures under review.

New Action Item 221102-2: Germán V. to contact the NRO EC to ask that the names of the RIR Board appointees to the ASO AC so that everyone will have time to prepare for the ASO AC chair election.

New Action Item 221102-3 Germán V. to schedule the onboarding session for newcomers around two weeks after this 2 November ASO AC meeting.

=====

Agenda

0. Welcome
 1. Roll Call
 2. Agenda Review
 3. Review October 2022 Minutes
 4. Review Open Actions
 5. Overview ASO AC Belgrade f2f Meeting
 6. ASO Workplans
 - a) Draft 2022 ASO AC Work Plan Activity Review - Volunteers
 - b) Draft 2023 ASO AC Work Plan - Volunteers
 7. Annual Transparency Review - Volunteers
 8. 2022 Annual ASO AC f2f Meeting
 9. ASO AC Chair Election
 10. 2023 ASO AC Teleconference Calendar
 11. Onboarding Session for newcomers to the ASO AC
 12. Reports
 - a) APNIC 54
 - b) LACNIC 38
 - c) ARIN 50
 - d) RIPE 85
 13. AOB
 14. Adjourn
- =====

0. Welcome

Hervé C. welcomed everyone to the meeting.

1. Roll Call

Roll call was performed at 12:05 and quorum was established.

2. Agenda Review

While sharing the proposed agenda on screen, Hervé C. moved to approve it as written. Esteban L. seconded the motion, no objections were heard, and the motion carried.

3. Review October 2022 Minutes

Hervé C. noted that he had sent the Secretariat some minor corrections to the minutes. Germán V. replied that those corrections had been implemented.

No additional remarks were heard, so Kevin B. moved to approve the October 2022 ASO AC meeting minutes. Shubham S. seconded the motion, no objections were heard so the motion carried.

4. Review Open Actions

Action Item 220511-1: GV to confirm with AFRINIC when a person will be appointed to take the place of Wafa Z. (whose resignation will take effect on 15 May 2022) on the ASO AC. **CLOSED**

Kevin B. reminded everyone that the suggestion had been to close Action Item 220511-1 for now, as no developments are expected given the current situation. No objections were heard.

Action Item 221024-1: GV to follow up with the NRO EC about the ASO AC's concerns re quorum, specifically, the current vacancy and the two vacancies that will soon occur in AFRINIC to see what the EC recommends as a way forward for the ASO AC. **ONGOING**

Germán V. reported that the information had been sent to the NRO EC and that the EC has started to discuss different approaches and options which are currently under discussion on the EC mailing list. The item will be added to the agenda of the next monthly EC teleconference, so information should be available for the December ASO AC teleconference.

Action Item 220803-1: Hervé C. and Esteban L. to do a preliminary review the 2022 ASO AC Workplan to see if there are any items that have been missed and that the ASO AC needs to work on sooner rather than later. This review will be ready for the September ASO AC meeting. **OPEN**

5. Overview ASO AC Belgrade f2f Meeting

Hervé C. mentioned that the Belgrade meeting had provided the AC an opportunity to extensively talk about our business and suggested the following action item:

New Action Item 221102-1: Each subgroup of the Procedures Review Team to meet before late November/early December to consolidate all the suggestions and discussions that took place in Belgrade and start working on a concrete proposal for each of the sections of the procedures under review.

Hervé C. said that he would send an email related to this action item once all the minutes of the f2f meeting have been circulated.

Esteban L. agreed that the f2f had been very useful in terms of the work that was done. The Procedures Review Team must now collect all the comments, go back to our small working groups, and prepare concrete proposals for rewording the changes that had the most consensus.

Hervé C. noted that, in January, the AC will have a new composition, i.e., a few new members.

Ricardo P. also agreed that it was great to have the opportunity for almost the entire group to be present in the same room.

Kevin B. observed that there was great consensus among the AC on many areas that can go back to the working groups. He then recommended that the people working on the areas that had had the most discussion and where differences may potentially arise should focus on preparing high-level bullet points so that the AC does not get stuck on the words. Focus should be on the intent, especially in the case of the procedures relating to the Board. In the case of the voting procedures, Kevin B. noted that the slide deck that Esteban L. had prepared for Belgrade had been very useful, as it had allowed seeing all the different procedures the AC has in place. He then suggested perhaps reducing the number to three or four, adding that the specific wording can be agreed later.

Hervé C. and Esteban L. agreed.

Hervé C. mentioned that he hopes that everyone who had attended a RIPE meeting for the first time had been able to enjoy it.

Ricardo P. replied that it had been a great meeting, and Esteban L. recommended having ACO AC meetings at an RIR meeting as a general practice when possible.

Shubham S. concluded that the level of discussion, output, and bonding that takes place at a f2f meeting cannot be compared with a virtual meeting.

6. ASO Workplans

a) Draft 2022 ASO AC Work Plan Activity Review - Volunteers

Hervé C. and Esteban L. volunteered to work on the Draft 2022 ASO AC Work Plan Activity Review.

b) Draft 2023 ASO AC Work Plan - Volunteers

Hervé C. said that it had been suggested in Belgrade that this time, rather than copy/paste from previous work plans, the AC might have a more in-depth review of what is written in the last work plan to see whether each action is needed, whether they are useful, and so on.

Esteban L. volunteered once again, noting that his work while reviewing the 2022 Work Plan will also be useful to prepare the 2023 Work Plan. He added that some of the discussions the AC had in Belgrade (e.g., define goals and criteria for what the AC is looking for when selecting an ICANN Board member) will create new tasks for 2023.

Hervé C. mentioned that a first presentation should be ready for the next ASO AC monthly meeting.

7. Annual Transparency Review – Volunteers

Hervé C. explained what the annual transparency review involves and noted that Kevin B. had worked a lot on this review last year.

Kevin B. said that he would be happy to volunteer again but would like to work with someone else, as two sets of eyes are better than one.

Mike S. said that he was uncertain whether he would be returning to the AC in January, so he is reluctant to volunteer

Shubham S. said that his term was ending so he was also unable to volunteer.

Esteban L. mentioned that most of the work should be completed by the end of December.

Mike S. concluded that outgoing or potentially outgoing AC members can work on the transparency review and 2022 Work Plan, but it would be better to have someone who is sure they will be on the AC next year work on the 2023 Work Plan.

Kevin B. agreed.

After some further discussion, Hervé C. asked Shubham S. to email Nicole C. to see whether she would like to volunteer.

8. 2022 Annual ASO AC f2f Meeting

Hervé C. asked whether there was any additional information on ICANN 76 (planning, etc.).

Ozan S replied that registration will open on 15 November and that he will let the AC know as soon as that happens. The only additional information at this time is that ICANN has shared a block schedule and one of the meetings discussed was a joint meeting of the ASO AC with the ICANN Board during ICANN 76, which was tentatively scheduled for Thursday, 16 March from 9:00 to 10:00 am local time.

Germán V. reminded everyone that support for ICANN meetings comes from the RIRs, so it would be good for everyone to contact their RIR so they can budget their participation for next year, i.e., given the interruption of ASO AC f2f meetings over the past couple of years, it would be good to remind the RIRs to include in their budget the f2f meeting of the ASO AC next year in Cancun.

Hervé C. noted that it would also be important to start discussing what the AC will be working on in Cancun.

Esteban L. then said that it would be useful to begin working in advance on a slide deck showing the AC function and current work, similar to the one James K. presented to the RIPE community, so that we will be prepared if we need to have this presentation at the fellow meeting or other instances.

Hervé C. agreed.

Kevin B. said that they need to split the work for the f2f in different areas: 1) the work on procedures to finalize the changes in March so they can be sent to the EC for approval; 2) the educational part, both toward the board meeting as well as for fellows and such; and 3) PTI has reached out to have a session with the AC at ICANN, so we need to discuss what that would look like.

To conclude, he recommended that, as soon as registration for ICANN 76 opens, AC members should make their reservations (provided that they are cancellable) before the rooms run out.

All agreed.

Hervé C. was disconnected from the call at this time.

9. ASO AC Chair Election

At Kevin B.'s request, Germán V. went over the dates for the ASO AC Chair election: the ASO AC chair election starts in December; he will send a reminder that nominations can be received from 1st to 31st

December. All ASO AC members are eligible to run as candidates and to vote. He will send the precise dates via email, but the election must be completed before the first ASO AC meeting of 2023.

Kevin B. asked if Germán V. can send our dates to the EC and ask the EC if they can have all RIR appointees nominated to give people time to prepare for the elections.

New Action Item 221102-2: Germán V. to contact the NRO EC to ask that the names of the RIR Board appointees to the ASO AC be available so that everyone will have time to prepare for the ASO AC chair election.

10. 2023 ASO AC Teleconference Calendar

Kevin B. said that Germán V. had prepared the 2023 ASO AC teleconference calendar, which is now available on the wiki.

After some discussion, it was decided that they would continue as usual (i.e., monthly teleconferences) until the ASO AC procedures are changed.

Germán V. brought up the issue of the time for ASO AC meetings, saying that these meetings are scheduled trying to make it as painless as possible for people to participate, particularly those in the ARIN and APNIC regions. He will need confirmation of all AC members before he can confirm the 12:00 UTC time slot. This may be up for discussion during the December teleconference once we have the names of all the members.

Kevin B. replied that given that AC members are geographically distributed, with the US West Coast and Australia being the two extremes, 12:00 UTC seems to be the best time for ASO AC teleconferences.

Esteban L. agreed with maintaining the current time for meetings so as not to have to change their agendas. While agreeing with Germán V.'s concern regarding the time slots, he strongly suggested maintaining the current meeting times.

Shubham S. and Jorge V. agreed that the current time slot works very well.

Mike S. summarized the discussion as follows: the ASO AC will keep the current schedule (monthly meetings) until the procedures change and the current time slot (12:00 UTC) until all new members are seated.

11. Onboarding Session for newcomers to the ASO AC

Considering that new members will be joining the AC, Mike S. asked when the newcomers session is typically scheduled.

Germán V. replied that they have two new members (one from ARIN, one from APNIC) and that this session can be held any time before the next cycle. He added that, last year, the onboarding session for newcomers was held two weeks after the ASO AC November teleconference.

At Mike S.'s suggestion, all agreed the following action item:

New Action Item 221102-3: Germán V. to schedule the onboarding session for newcomers around two weeks after this 2 November ASO AC meeting.

12. Reports

a) APNIC 54

It was noted that Nicole C. had circulated a report via email.

Shubham S. the provided the following update:

- APNIC 54 was held in Singapore on 8-15 September 2022.
- There were 558 in person and 635 online attendees for this first hybrid APNIC meeting.
- There was also good traction on social media.
- NRO NC election results: Gaurav Kansal was the winner and will be taking over from Shubham S.
- Three SIG co-chairs were elected (Cooperation SIG, NIT SIG, and Policy SIG).
- Nicole C. was reappointed to the NRO NC/ASO AC for another year.
- Open policy meeting: Two proposals reached consensus (Single Source for Definitions; Aligning the Contrast); two did not reach consensus (Historical Resources Management; Leasing of Resources is not Acceptable).
- The next conference will be APRICOT 2023, to be held in Manila, Philippines, from 20 February to 2 March 2023.

Hervé C. rejoined the meeting at this time.

b) LACNIC 38

Ricardo P. noted that he had shared a report via email and then shared the following highlights:

- LACNIC 38 – LACNOG 2022 was held in early October in Bolivia.
- It was a hybrid meeting (in person and via Zoom) with a good number of attendees both online and on site.
- LACNIC presents a Lifetime Achievement Award to people with a long history in the industry. During this year's second meeting Harmut Glaser, a former ASO AC member, received the award. Lito Ibarra was also presented with his award, which had been announced in 2021 but had not been able to receive in person due to the pandemic.
- Six policy proposals were presented, three of which were to update the text of the policy document, two to address the PDP, and only one was for resource certification (if returned, IP addresses allocated to critical infrastructure should go back to the pool reserved for critical infrastructure).
- The next LACNIC meeting will be held in Merida, Mexico.

Esteban L. added that the meeting had been very dynamic, with strong participation both on site and remotely, and that the discussion of the six policy proposals had been very interesting. He concluded by saying that the meeting had been very important as, in some way, LACNIC had gone back to the way meetings were prior to the pandemic.

c) ARIN 50

Kevin B. provided the following update:

- ARIN 50 took place in October.
- He mentioned the policy proposals that had been discussed, which did not include any global policy.

- It was an interesting meeting. Many policies were discussed, but many of them were simply meant to clean up the text.
- Martin H. is winding down his term, Nick Nugent was just elected by the ARIN region.

d) RIPE 85

Hervé C. said he would begin the update and then give James K. the chance to talk about the policy proposals, as he is in the policy working group.

- It was a very complete meeting with 748 checked-in attendees (493 onsite, 255 online).
- It was the second RIPE meeting held in hybrid format, but in Europe people like to attend in person.
- An interesting point: the problematic in Ukraine.
- James K. was reelected to the AC.

James K. noted that there had been one policy proposal (Remove Mandatory IPv4 PA Assignment Registration in the RIPE Database). The proposal is not getting much traction, further definitions would be required, the current draft does not seem to be getting consensus. At the moment, the chairs are discussing whether to move forward with the proposal in its current form or send it back for discussion by the community.

13. AOB

No further business was brought up for discussion.

14. Adjourn

There being nothing further to discuss, Mike S. moved to adjourn the meeting, Hervé C. seconded the motion, no objections were heard, and the meeting was adjourned at 12:02 UTC.